



## Effect of School Culture on Students' Socialization at Secondary Level in Punjab

Muhamad Shahid Afzaal, Shehzad Ahmad, Muhammad Tahir Khan Farooqi

### Chronicle

#### Article history

**Received:** June 1, 2024

**Received in the revised format:** June 10, 2024

**Accepted:** June 22, 2024

**Available online:** June 30, 2024

**Muhamad Shahid Afzaal, Shehzad Ahmad & Muhammad Tahir Khan Farooqi** are currently affiliated with Education, University of Okara, Pakistan.

**Email:** [shahidgilani198@gmail.com](mailto:shahidgilani198@gmail.com)

**Email:** [dr.shehzad@uo.edu.pk](mailto:dr.shehzad@uo.edu.pk)

**Email:** [drtahirfarooqi@uo.edu.pk](mailto:drtahirfarooqi@uo.edu.pk)

### Abstract

School culture refers to the shared beliefs, values, attitudes, behaviours, and practices that shape how a school operates and interacts. The study's objectives were to explore the school culture and determine the effect of school culture on students' socialization at the secondary level. A survey was conducted to gather data from 24 secondary schools from each randomly selected division of Punjab among 10th-grade students on aspects like academic achievement, socialization, and cooperative learning. A self-developed questionnaire was used to obtain data from the chosen sample. The study evaluated several factors, including socialization, academic achievement, leadership, and student improvement. To investigate the links between these concepts, correlation studies were conducted. In this study, it was found that student's academic performance, the quality of school leadership, and the prevalence of cooperative learning were all positively correlated with a more positive school culture. Students' socialization was positively influenced by their academic performance. The results stress the significance of school culture in determining the diverse experiences and outcomes of students. A positive school culture that encourages socialization, and cooperative learning should be the main goals. Schools can contribute to their overall development and well-being by implementing the recommendations and conducting further research.

### Corresponding Author\*

**Keywords:** School Culture, Students' Socialization, Cooperative Learning, Staff Moral.

© 2024 The Asian Academy of Business and social science research Ltd Pakistan.

## INTRODUCTION

The school culture describes the beliefs, values, attitudes, behaviors, and practices that guide the way a school operates and interacts. It encompasses the visible and invisible aspects of a school's environment, including students' physical and emotional safety, the organization's structure, and the relationships among its members (Kalkan et al., 2020). It has become clear that school culture is a critical determinant of student success for researchers, policymakers, and teachers alike (Deal & Peterson, 2016). Teachers, administrators, students, parents, and community stakeholders form the school's culture. These beliefs and perceptions may be implicit or explicit, shaping everything from instructional practices to student behavior management strategies (Darder, 2015). To address behavior problems, a school that values strict discipline may resort to punitive measures, such as suspensions and expulsions (Byrd, 2015). The relationships among its members also shape school culture. These relationships can be formal, such as between teachers and students, or informal, such as between colleagues. They can also be positive or negative, depending on the quality of communication, collaboration, and member trust (Haines et al., 2015). Students may be more engaged and achieve higher academic levels when teachers and students have strong, positive relationships

(Heinrichs, 2018). School culture is reflected in the physical and emotional safety of its students. This includes the physical environment, such as the layout of classrooms and public spaces, and the emotional climate, such as the degree to which students feel valued and supported. Schools that prioritize emotional safety may have programs and practices to promote positive mental health and social-emotional learning (Dutt & Sahney, 2016). School culture is a complex construct encompassing many attitudes, values, interactions, and practices. Both conscious and unconscious factors shape it and can significantly impact student outcomes (Teunissen, 2015). A school's culture is heavily influenced by its institutional history, including its founding principles and historical experiences. From the school's mission statement to its disciplinary practices, the school's history can have a profound impact (DeMatthews, 2015). To gain a deeper understanding of a school's culture, it is essential to understand its institutional history (Gruenert & Whitaker, 2015).

Different stakeholders, including students, parents, teachers, administrators, and other staff members, also contribute to school culture. As each group contributes perspectives, beliefs, and values, it can have a varied impact on the school community's culture. A teacher may prioritize academic achievement and rigorous standards, while a parent may prioritize students' well-being and social-emotional development (Darder, 2015). The culture of a school is also influenced by external factors such as policy and community. From extracurricular activities offered to the language spoken by students and staff, the community in which a school is located can have a significant impact on a school's culture (Delpit, 1995). Additionally, policies and regulations can influence school culture significantly at the local, state, and national levels (Morton et al., 2016). The culture of a school may be influenced by standardized testing policies to emphasize test preparation and rote memorization (Muller & Kerbow, 2018).

By establishing values and norms that support social-emotional learning and well-being, school culture can be used as a tool to promote positive student socialization. As a result of engaging parents meaningfully, positive values can be reinforced and a cohesive school community can emerge (Carpenter, 2015). According to Nazarian et al. (2017), culture is based on a set of shared basic assumptions a group has developed over time as it has solved the problems of external adaptation and internal integration. A stable environment may, on the other hand, emphasize consistency and reliability (Felipe et al., 2017). Internal integration refers to the extent to which organization members share common values, beliefs, and behavior (Bakhsh Magsi et al., 2018). External adaptation refers to the extent to which the organization can adapt to changing external conditions and remain competitive. A strong culture can help to promote internal integration and external adaptation by providing a shared sense of identity and purpose and guiding decision-making (González-Rodríguez et al., 2019).

## **School Culture**

School culture can only be comprehended with an understanding of culture itself. Culture is a vast and complex notion since it is open to different interpretations by different people and groups. It's hard to make sense of one thing (Schein, 2004). Sabanci et al. (2017) define culture as a culturally entrenched idea that impacts our perception and behavior and is expressed via our thoughts, beliefs, and behaviors. Because one's culture mirrors one's accumulated cultural experiences, it may be observed in one's

personality and behavior. According to Sabanci et al. (2017), an organization's artifacts are its outwardly apparent structures and procedures, which include its norms, standards, conventions, and physical qualities. The principles, values, ambitions, and aspirations expressed by an organization or person (Schein, 2010). Guidelines for organizational behavior consist of ideal methods, aims, and principles (Sabanci et al., 2017). The last component, taken-for-granted ideas and values, are the essential underlying assumptions. Cultural norms provide a framework for understanding the world, influencing how people feel and act in different circumstances (Schein, 2010).

According to research by Karadag and Oztekin-Bayir (2018), school culture consists of "the shared values and beliefs, the signs and symbols, and the understanding among the members of a school. According to Grunert (2011), a school's culture may be inferred from its underlying ideas, norms, and practices. The personality of a school is formed by the shared norms, values, beliefs, and traditions of its administration, faculty, and students (Karadag et al., 2014). It reflects the ingrained norms, customs, and traditions that have developed. Moreover, culture is perpetual and ever-changing; hence, it is important to foster one that supports both students and teachers and in which education plays a central role (Prokopchuk, 2016). The values, norms, and beliefs of a school's community are partly shaped by the school's symbols, artifacts, traditions, and practices, even if many schools have common organizational features (Horton, 2018). Consequently, each institution of higher learning has its unique culture. Each company has its own distinct culture, which is important to consider while trying to figure it out (Kalman & Balkar, 2017).

Many people have a hard time distinguishing between culture and climate. The two phrases have been used interchangeably, and academics in education have struggled to make sense of their differences. This may be because abstract concepts make more sense when seen in the specific context of each discipline (Parker, 2015). While some teachers may conflate the two terms, there is substantial differentiation between school culture and climate (Glisson, 2015; Nadelson et al., 2020). Culture is a system of common attitudes that binds and gives it a particular character, whereas climate describes changes in working settings (Hoy, 1990). Organizational members' perceptions of one another are measured by climate, whereas members' attitudes and values are determined by culture (Van Houtte, 2005). Hoy (1990) argues that schools are most successful when they foster a positive atmosphere for learning, but recent research suggests that schools' cultures are more indicative of their identities.

According to research by Van der Westhuizen et al. (2005), schools with strong cultures are more likely to succeed in attaining their stated missions. Therefore, schools must provide the supportive environments needed for staff and students' academic and personal growth. A healthy school culture influences many facets of a school, including students' motivation, instructors' dedication, job satisfaction, students' and teachers' ability to work together, and developing a strong sense of community (Kythreotis et al., 2010). Collaborative leadership, teacher cooperation, professional development, unity of purpose, shared support, and learning partnerships are a few characteristics of a strong school culture. Without considering these elements, you can't fully grasp a school's collaborative culture. According to Gruenert (2005), students and instructors benefit most from an educational environment that encourages and supports collaboration. A culture of cooperation is crucial to the institution's never-ending quest for excellence (Zahed-Babelan et al., 2019).

## HYPOTHESES OF THE STUDY

The following were the hypotheses of this study;

**H<sub>0</sub>1.** There is no significant effect of school culture at the secondary level.

**H<sub>0</sub>2.** There is no significant effect of school culture on students' attractiveness.

**H<sub>0</sub>3.** There is no significant impact of school leadership on students' socialization.

**H<sub>0</sub>4.** There is no significant impact of students' achievements on students' socialization.

**H<sub>0</sub>5.** There is no impact of school culture on the cooperative learning of students.

### Sample of the Study

To determine the equal representation of public sector secondary schools, the Punjab province was divided into three sampling regions, Upper Punjab, Central Punjab, and Southern Punjab (Shakir, Hussian, & Zaffar, 2011). The 10<sup>th</sup> grade students' enrollment in public sector secondary schools of the Punjab province was above 500000 (sis.punjab.gov.pk). A total of 1440 students were included to survey the study at hand. The rationale of the sample participants was made according to the guideline suggested by Cohen, Manion, and Morrison (2008), So, 1044 students were included as a sample of the study which indicated the above level of the actual range size.

### Research Design

The present research was quantitative in nature and a survey method was applied. A quantitative method is selected because it is viewed as an effective method for gathering large amounts of data to address comprehensive issues at a specified period. Furthermore, the quantitative approach was emphasized to investigate the effect of school culture on students' socialization could better be understood by collecting large quantitative data in a formal, structured, and rigid manner. The survey design also allowed for more confidentiality with those being surveyed (Malhotra & Dash, 2011). Those surveyed were asked specific questions and details about School Culture and Students' Socialization. The surveys were cross-sectional and collected during the selected period.

## DATA PRESENTED, ANALYSIS, AND INTERPRETATION

### Regression Analysis of School Culture in Secondary Schools

**H<sub>0</sub>1:** There is no significant effect of school culture at the secondary level.

**Table 1.**  
**Regression analysis of school culture in secondary Schools**

		Parameters	Standard Error	t-ratio	Sig	R <sup>2</sup>
<b>School culture</b>	Rural	2.018	0.262	6.197	0.000	0.214
	Urban	2.134	0.374	4.354	0.000	0.164

The regression analysis examines the relationship of school culture with different localities (Rural and Urban). For the Rural locality, the model estimates a constant value of 2.018 with a standard error of 0.262. The t-ratio of 6.197 is significant at  $p < 0.001$ , indicating that the relationship between school culture and the rural locality is statistically significant.

Similarly, for the urban locality, the model estimates a constant value of 2.134 with a standard error of 0.374. The t-ratio of 4.354 is also significant at  $p < 0.001$ , suggesting that the relationship between school culture and the urban locality is statistically significant. The R-squared values of 0.226 for Rural and 0.164 for Urban indicate that the models explain 22.6% and 16.4% of the variance in school culture for Rural and Urban localities respectively. Since the p-values are less than the typical significance level (such as 0.05), the null hypothesis of no relationship between school culture and locality is rejected, implying that the locality (Rural or Urban) has a significant impact on school culture.

**H<sub>0</sub>2.** There is no significant impact of school culture on students' attractiveness.

**Table 2.**  
**Regression Analysis of school culture on students' attractiveness**

	Parameters	Standard Error	t-ratio	Sig	R <sup>2</sup>
Students' attractiveness	2.212	0.289	8.512	0.000	0.217

**Regression Analysis of school culture on students' attractiveness**

The analysis found that the constant term in the model was 2.212, with a standard error of 0.289 and a t-ratio of 8.512, leading to an extremely low p-value of 0.000. The coefficient of determination (R<sup>2</sup>) was 0.217, indicating that approximately 21.7% of the variability in students' attractiveness could be explained by the model. Since the p-value is significantly below the common threshold of 0.05, the null hypothesis would be rejected. This implies that there is a statistically significant relationship between school culture and students' attractiveness.

**H<sub>0</sub>3.** There is no significant impact of school leadership on students' socialization.

**Table 3.**  
**Regression Analysis of school leadership on students' socialization**

	Parameters	Standard Error	t-ratio	Sig	R <sup>2</sup>
School leadership	2.384	0.864	8.347	0.000	0.287

In the regression analysis examining the impact of school leadership on students' socialization. The constant term is 2.384, with a corresponding standard error of 0.864 and a t-ratio of 8.347. The associated p-value is 0.000, indicating high significance. The coefficient of determination (R<sup>2</sup>) for the model is 0.287, meaning that approximately 28.7% of the variability in students' socialization can be explained by the model. Since the p-value is significantly low, the null hypothesis is rejected. This suggests that there is a significant relationship between school leadership and students' socialization.

**H<sub>0</sub>4.** There is no significant impact of students' achievements on students' socialization.

**Table 4.**  
**Regression Analysis of academic achievements on students' socialization**

	Parameters	Standard Error	t-ratio	Sig	R <sup>2</sup>
Academic achievements	2.981	0.831	4.861	0.000	0.161

**Regression Analysis of academic achievements on students' socialization**

In the regression analysis examining the impact of academic achievements on students' socialization, the model's constant term was 2.981, with a standard error of 0.831 and a t-ratio of 4.861, leading to a highly significant p-value of 0.000. The coefficient of determination (R<sup>2</sup>) for the model was 0.161, indicating that approximately 16.1% of the variability in students' socialization was explained by the model. The significant p-value suggests a significant relationship between academic achievements and students' socialization. Therefore, the null hypothesis would be rejected, implying that there is a significant association between academic achievements and students' socialization.

**H<sub>05</sub>**. There is no effect of school culture on the cooperative learning of students.

**Table 5.**  
**Regression Analysis school culture on the cooperative learning of students**

	Parameters	Standard Error	t-ratio	Sig	R <sup>2</sup>
<b>Cooperative learning</b>	1.275	0.288	8.044	0.000	0.184

**Regression Analysis school culture on the cooperative learning of students**

In the regression analysis exploring the impact of school culture on students' cooperative learning, a model was constructed with a single parameter. The constant term in the model was found to be 1.275, with a standard error of 0.288 and a t-ratio of 8.044. The associated p-value was highly significant at 0.000, indicating a strong statistical relationship. The coefficient of determination (R<sup>2</sup>) for the model was 0.184, indicating approximately 18.4% of the variance in students' cooperative learning scores. Given the highly significant p-value and the positive relationship between school culture and students' cooperative learning, it can be inferred that the null hypothesis is rejected. This suggests that there is a significant and positive relationship between school culture and students' cooperative learning, implying that higher levels of school culture are associated with increased engagement in cooperative learning activities among students.

**Table 6.**  
**Result Summary of the Hypotheses**

Hypothesis Number	Hypothesis-Statement	Path Coefficients	t-Statistics	P-value	Decision(Null Hypothesis)
<b>H<sub>01</sub></b>	School Culture→ Secondary Schools	0.262	6.197**	0.000	Rejected
<b>H<sub>02</sub></b>	School Culture →Students' Socialization	0.234	5.374**	0.000	Rejected
<b>H<sub>03</sub></b>	School Leadership →Students' Socialization School	0.287	8.347	0.000	Rejected
<b>H<sub>04</sub></b>	Academic Achievements →Students' Socialization	0.134	6.374	0.000	Rejected
<b>H<sub>05</sub></b>	School Culture→ Cooperative Learning	0.184	8.044	0.000	Rejected

## DISCUSSION

The study results indicate that the school culture is generally positive and impacts the school environment. The majority of students agree or strongly agree that the school culture promotes a sense of community among students, positive relationships between teachers and students, respect and tolerance for diversity, and supports various aspects of student development such as well-being, leadership and responsibility, and creativity. The positive assessment of school culture among students is a major finding that aligns well with previous research that highlights the crucial significance of a welcoming school environment in creating successful learning outcomes. This aligns with the tenets of a positive school environment, which refers to the quality and character of school life, as well as the values, conventions, and social interactions within the school community.

Another crucial element of a positive school culture is collaborative learning. According to sociocultural theory, learning is facilitated when students engage in collaborative activities and open dialogue with both teachers and peers (Zhao, 2018). The complex relationship between educational success and the growth of interpersonal competence and social behaviors within the school setting is highlighted by the correlation between academic accomplishment and socialization. According to Smith et al. (2021), this conclusion aligns with previous research that emphasizes the many ways in which schools foster students' academic and social development. Recent research has broadened the idea to include its influence on non-cognitive elements including self-esteem, self-efficacy, and social relationships, which were previously thought to be indicators of cognitive capability (Semeraro et al., 2020).

This paradigm shift recognizes that academic success may affect a student's life outside of the classroom and influence relationships with peers and teachers. Effective school leadership is associated with creating a positive school climate that supports student well-being and engagement (Kutsyuruba et al., 2015). Leaders who model positive behaviors and attitudes can influence how students perceive their self-worth and attractiveness within the school context. The interplay between school improvement efforts, cooperative learning, and related factors underscores the comprehensive nature of educational enhancement. Cooperative learning emphasizes collaborative interactions among students and has enhanced social skills, critical thinking, and overall learning outcomes (Datu et al., 2023). Such achievements enhance students' self-perception and influence their social interactions, contributing to a positive and supportive school environment.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the comprehensive analysis of the data and the findings from the study, several recommendations can be put forth to enhance the educational experience for both students and teachers:

- Recognizing the positive correlation between academic achievements and socialization, schools should invest in academic support programs.
- School leaders should actively work towards creating and maintaining a positive school culture.

- Providing leadership development and training programs for teachers can empower them to lead classrooms and promote positive social behaviors effectively. Strong leadership can mitigate organizational silence, enhance staff morale, and contribute to an overall healthier school culture.
- Schools should actively encourage and facilitate collaborative learning experiences.
- It's essential for schools to regularly assess the impact of implemented strategies and make necessary adaptations. This involves collecting feedback from students, teachers, and parents to gauge the effectiveness of initiatives to enhance socialization, school culture, and academic achievements.

## DECLARATIONS

**Acknowledgement:** We appreciate the generous support from all the contributor of research and their different affiliations.

**Funding:** No funding body in the public, private, or nonprofit sectors provided a particular grant for this research.

**Availability of data and material:** In the approach, the data sources for the variables are stated.

**Authors' contributions:** Each author participated equally to the creation of this work.

**Conflicts of Interests:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

**Consent to Participate:** Yes

- **Consent for publication and Ethical approval:** Because this study does not include human or animal data, ethical approval is not required for publication. All authors have given their consent.

## REFERENCES

- Allen, N., Grigsby, B., & Peters, M. L. (2015). Does leadership matter? Examining the relationship among transformational leadership, school climate, and student achievement. *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation, 10*(2), 1-22.
- Bakhsh Magsi, H., Ong, T.S., Ho, J.A. and Sheikh Hassan, A.F., 2018. Organizational culture and environmental performance. *Sustainability, 10*(8), p.2690.
- Byrd, C. M. (2015). The associations of intergroup interactions and school racial socialization with academic motivation. *The Journal of Educational Research, 108*(1), 10-21.
- Carpenter, D., 2015. School culture and leadership of professional learning communities. *International Journal of Educational Management, 29*(5), pp.682-694.
- Darder, A., 2015. *Culture and power in the classroom: Educational foundations for the schooling of bicultural students*. Routledge.
- Deal, T. E., & Peterson, K. D. (2016). *Shaping school culture*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Delpit, L., 2006. Lessons from teachers. *Journal of teacher education, 57*(3), pp.220-231.
- DeMatthews, D., 2015. Making sense of social justice leadership: A case study of a principal's experiences to create a more inclusive school. *Leadership and Policy in schools, 14*(2), pp.139-166.
- Dutta, V. and Sahney, S., 2016. School leadership and its impact on student achievement: The mediating role of school climate and teacher job satisfaction. *International Journal of Educational Management, 30*(6), pp.941-958.
- Felipe, C.M., Roldán, J.L. and Leal-Rodríguez, A.L., 2017. Impact of organizational culture values on organizational agility. *Sustainability, 9*(12), p.2354.
- Glisson, C., 2015. The role of organizational culture and climate in innovation and effectiveness. *Human service organizations: management, leadership & governance, 39*(4), pp.245-250.



- Golden, S.D., McLeroy, K.R., Green, L.W., Earp, J.A.L. and Lieberman, L.D., 2015. Upending the social-ecological model to guide health promotion efforts toward policy and environmental change. *Health Education & Behavior*, 42(1\_suppl), pp.8S-14S.
- Gruenert, S. and Whitaker, T., 2015. *School culture rewired: How to define, assess, and transform it*. ASCD.
- Grunert, K.G., Perrea, T., Zhou, Y., Huang, G., Sørensen, B.T. and Krystallis, A., 2011. Is food-related lifestyle (FRL) able to reveal food consumption patterns in non-Western cultural environments? adaptation and application in urban China. *Appetite*, 56(2), pp.357-367.
- Haines, S. J., Gross, J. M., Blue-Banning, M., Francis, G. L., & Turnbull, A. P. (2015). Fostering family-school, and community-school partnerships in inclusive schools: Using practice as a guide. *Research and Practice for persons with severe disabilities*, 40(3), 227-239.
- Heinrichs, J., 2018. School leadership is based on a philosophy and pedagogy of parent engagement. *School Leadership & Management*, 38(2), pp.187-201.
- Horton Jr, J.A., 2018. A descriptive study of school climate and school culture in selected public secondary schools in New Jersey and New York.
- Hoy, W.K., 1990. Organizational climate and culture: A conceptual analysis of the school workplace. *Journal of educational and psychological consultation*, 1(2), pp.149-168.
- Kalkan, Ü., Altınay Aksal, F., Altınay Gazi, Z., Atasoy, R. and Dağlı, G., 2020. The relationship between school administrators' leadership styles, school culture, and organizational image. *Sage Open*, 10(1), p.2158244020902081.
- Karadag, E., & Oztekin-Bayir, O. (2018). The effect of authentic leadership on school culture: A structural equation model. *IJELM*, 6(1), 40-75.
- Karadag, E., Kilicoglu, G., & Yilmaz, D. (2014). Organizational Cynicism, School Culture, and Academic Achievement: The Study of Structural Equation Modeling. *Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*, 14(1), 102-113.
- Kutsyuruba, B., Klinger, D.A. and Hussain, A., 2015. Relationships among school climate, school safety, and student achievement and well-being: a review of the literature. *Review of Education*, 3(2), pp.103-135.
- Kythreotis, A., Pashiardis, P. and Kyriakides, L., 2010. The influence of school leadership styles and culture on students' achievement in Cyprus primary schools. *Journal of Educational Administration*.
- Mamnoun, S., & Nfissi, A. (2023). Investigating Classroom Interaction from a Gender Perspective: A Comprehensive Review of Relevant Studies. *Journal of World Englishes and Educational Practices*, 5(2), 17-27.
- Morton, K.L., Atkin, A.J., Corder, K., Suhrcke, M. and Van Sluijs, E.M.F., 2016. The school environment and adolescent physical activity and sedentary behavior: a mixed-studies systematic review. *Obesity Reviews*, 17(2), pp.142-158.
- Muller, C. and Kerbow, D., 2018. Parent involvement in the home, school, and community. In *Parents, their children, and schools* (pp. 13-42). Routledge.
- Nadelson, L.S., Albritton, S., Couture, V.G., Green, C., Loyless, S.D. and Shaw, E.O., 2020. Principals' Perceptions of Education Equity: A Mindset for Practice. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 9(1), pp.1-15.
- Nazarian, A., Atkinson, P. and Foroudi, P., 2017. Influence of national culture and balanced organizational culture on the hotel industry's performance. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 63, pp.22-32.
- Pearson, P. L. (2015). High school culture, graduation rates, and dropouts' rate. (Doctoral thesis). The University of Southern Mississippi, Retrieved from <http://aquila.usm.edu/dissertations/55>.
- Prokopchuk, J., 2016. Unpacking the impact of school culture: A principal's role in creating and sustaining the culture of a school. *SELU Research Review Journal*, 1(2), pp.73-82.
- Sabancı, A., Sahin, A., Sönmez, M.A. and Yilmaz, O., 2017. Views of School Managers and Teachers about School Culture. *Online Submission*, 8(1), pp.28-45.

- Semeraro, C., Giofrè, D., Coppola, G., Lucangeli, D., & Cassibba, R. (2020). The role of cognitive and non-cognitive factors in mathematics achievement: The importance of the quality of the student-teacher relationship in middle school. *Plos one*, 15(4), e0231381.
- Smith, B. E., Pacheco, M. B., & Khorosheva, M. (2021). Emergent bilingual students and digital multimodal composition: A systematic review of research in secondary classrooms. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 56(1), 33-52.
- Teunissen, P.W., 2015. Experience, trajectories, and reifications: an emerging framework of practice-based learning in healthcare workplaces. *Advances in Health Sciences Education*, 20, pp.843-856.
- Van der Westhuizen, P.C., Mosoge, M.J., Swanepoel, L.H. and Coetsee, L.D., 2005. Organizational culture and academic achievement in secondary schools. *Education and Urban Society*, 38(1), pp.89-109.
- Van Houtte, M., 2005. Climate or culture? A plea for conceptual clarity in school effectiveness research. *School effectiveness and school improvement*, 16(1), pp.71-89
- Zahed-Babelan, A., Koulaei, G., Moeinikia, M. and Sharif, A.R., 2019. Instructional leadership effects on teachers' work engagement: Roles of school culture, empowerment, and job characteristics. *CEPS Journal*, 9(3), pp.137-156.
- Zhao, H. (2018). New insights into the process of peer review for EFL writing: A process-oriented socio-cultural perspective. *Learning and Instruction*, 58, 263-273.



2024 by the authors; The Asian Academy of Business and social science research Ltd Pakistan. This is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).